

**THE IMPACT OF HISTORICAL METAL MINING  
ON THE RIVER SWALE CATCHMENT,  
NORTH YORKSHIRE, U.K.**

**IAN DENNIS**



**UNIVERSITY OF WALES, ABERYSTWYTH  
JULY 2005**

## **ABSTRACT**

---

This investigation examines the impact of historical metal mining on the River Swale catchment, North Yorkshire, U.K. Approximately 550,000 tonnes of Pb were extracted from mines in the Swale catchment during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. Mining and processing operations were relatively inefficient, leading to the discharge of large quantities of metal-rich sediment into the fluvial system. The primary aim of this thesis is to assess the physical and chemical impacts of the discharge of metals from historical mining activities on the River Swale catchment as a whole. The dispersal, storage and transfer of metal-rich sediment in formerly mined tributaries, floodplain and flood sediments are evaluated, and the environmental consequences of mining are assessed.

A detailed geochemical survey of the River Swale catchment indicates that channel and floodplain sediments within formerly mined tributaries exhibit extremely high concentrations of Pb, Zn and Cd. Similar enrichment is observed in floodplain sediments from throughout the catchment, suggesting that large volumes of material have been transported from the tributaries and deposited on the Swale floodplain. Evidence from contemporary flood sediments suggests that considerable quantities of metal-rich sediment continue to be cycled through the system almost 100 years after the cessation of mining operations. Sediment budgeting suggests that 32,000 tonnes of Pb remain stored in formerly mined tributaries, with a further 123,000 tonnes stored in the Swale floodplain. Combined storage represents more than half of the total Pb that is likely to have been released during mining operations, suggesting that the impacts of metal mining are extremely long-lasting. Concentrations of Pb, Zn and Cd in tributary, floodplain and flood sediments greatly exceed current U.K. environmental quality guidelines and catchment-specific background values. Metal enrichment as a result of historical mining operations could therefore pose a serious and long-term threat to plant and animal health in the Swale catchment.

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

---

First, I would like to thank my supervisors, Dr. Tom Coulthard, Professor Mark Macklin, and Dr. Paul Brewer, for their advice and help with all aspects of this thesis. Grateful thanks are also extended to Dr. Bill Perkins, Dr. Nick Pearce, Lorraine Hill, Lorraine Morrison and Wynne Ebenezer, without whose invaluable guidance geochemical analyses would have proved impossible! Ian Gulley and Anthony Smith are also thanked for their assistance in producing several of the figures included in this thesis. Dr. John Ridgway is thanked for the provision of BGS G-Base data for the Swale catchment, and Dr. Sean Longfield and Victoria Townend of the Environment Agency are thanked for providing flow data from the Catterick Bridge gauging station. Thanks are also extended to the landowners of the River Swale catchment, without whose co-operation this investigation would have been impossible. Eric Johnstone, Phillippa Noble, Anna Jones, Graham Bird, Simon Gittins, Jonathan Turner and Liz Young are all thanked for their helpful discussions and much appreciated assistance with field work, and Marco van de Wiel is thanked for his advice with all things mathematical and computational.

I would also like to thank all my friends here in Aberystwyth for their assistance with ‘rest and recuperation’, especially Eric, Simon, Zenobia, Natalie, and Graham. Finally, deepest thanks are extended to my parents, Nicola, and of course Clare, who have helped me through my studies with their support and encouragement.

Ordnance Survey Landline data appears in Figures 4.6, 5.3 – 5.14 and 7.2.

© Crown Copyright Ordnance Survey. An EDINA Digimap/ JISC supplied service.

---

## CONTENTS

---

<b>ABSTRACT</b>	<b>i</b>
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</b>	<b>ii</b>
<b>TABLE OF CONTENTS</b>	<b>iii</b>
<b>LIST OF FIGURES</b>	<b>x</b>
<b>LIST OF TABLES</b>	<b>xiv</b>
<b>LIST OF PLATES</b>	<b>xvi</b>

### **CHAPTER 1**

#### **INTRODUCTION: METALS IN FLUVIAL SEDIMENTS**

<b>1.1. Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1.2. Metals in fluvial sediments: a review</b>	<b>3</b>
1.2.1. Introduction	<b>3</b>
1.2.2. The behaviour of metals in fluvial sediments	3
1.2.3. Metal transport in fluvial sediments	6
1.2.4. Metal storage in fluvial sediments	9
1.2.5. Remobilisation of metals	11
1.2.6. The geomorphological impacts of metal mining	12
1.2.7. Summary: Metals in fluvial sediments	15
<b>1.3. Thesis background and aims</b>	<b>15</b>

### **CHAPTER 2**

#### **STUDY AREA: THE RIVER SWALE CATCHMENT AND ITS MINING HISTORY**

<b>2.1. The River Swale catchment</b>	<b>18</b>
2.1.1. General characteristics	18

2.1.2. Catchment geology	20
2.1.3. Mineralisation	22
2.1.4. Catchment geochemistry	24
2.1.5. Glacial history and Holocene development	25
2.1.6. Fluvial geomorphology	25
<b>2.2. Metal mining in the Swale catchment</b>	<b>31</b>
2.2.1. The history of lead mining in Swaledale	31
2.2.2. Mining and processing techniques	32
2.2.3. Mining production records	39
<b>2.3. The impact of metal mining on the River Swale system</b>	<b>42</b>
2.3.1. The potential impacts of mining and processing	42
2.3.2. Investigations of floodplain contamination	43
2.3.2.1. <i>Upland contamination patterns</i>	43
2.3.2.2. <i>Piedmont contamination patterns</i>	44
2.3.2.3. <i>Lowland contamination patterns</i>	45
2.3.2.4. <i>Summary of catchment-scale patterns</i>	45
2.3.3. Investigations of channel sediment contamination	46
2.3.4. Summary and required research	48
 <b>CHAPTER 3</b>	
<b>GEOCHEMICAL CHARACTERISATION OF FLUVIAL SEDIMENTS IN THE SWALE CATCHMENT</b>	
<b>3.1. Introduction</b>	<b>50</b>
<b>3.2. Laboratory methods</b>	<b>51</b>
3.2.1. Particle size selection	51
3.2.2. Initial sample preparation	51
3.2.3. Digestion procedure	52
3.2.4. ICP-MS analysis	54
<b>3.3. Analytical Quality Control</b>	<b>55</b>
3.3.1. Approaches to AQC	55
3.3.2. Quality control during sample collection	55
3.3.3. Quality control during sample preparation and analysis	56
3.3.4. Data quality: AQC results	57
<b>3.4. Summary</b>	<b>58</b>

**CHAPTER 4****THE IMPACT OF METAL MINING ON HEADWATER TRIBUTARIES OF THE RIVER SWALE: THE GUNNERSIDE BECK CATCHMENT**

<b>4.1. Introduction</b>	<b>59</b>
<b>4.2. Study Area: Gunnerside Beck</b>	<b>60</b>
4.2.1. General characteristics	60
4.2.2. Catchment geology and mineralisation	60
4.2.3. Fluvial geomorphology	63
<b>4.3. Mining in Gunnerside Beck</b>	<b>68</b>
4.3.1. Mining history	68
4.3.2. The Blakethwaite mines	68
4.3.3. The Lownathwaite mines	70
4.3.4. The Old Gang mines	73
4.3.5. Sir Francis Level	74
4.3.6. Summary: The legacy of mining in Gunnerside Beck	75
<b>4.4. The impact of mining on catchment geochemistry</b>	<b>76</b>
4.4.1. Introduction	76
4.4.2. Methods	76
4.4.3. Patterns of metal dispersal in mine waste	76
4.4.4. Patterns of metal dispersal in floodplain sediments	80
4.4.5. Patterns of metal dispersal in channel sediments	87
4.4.6. Grain size partitioning	93
4.4.7. Summary: The geochemical legacy of mining in Gunnerside Beck	95
<b>4.5. The impact of mining on fluvial geomorphology</b>	<b>98</b>
4.5.1. Introduction	98
4.5.2. Morphological changes attributable to mining	98
4.5.3. Morphological changes since the cessation of mining	101
4.5.4. Summary: The geomorphological legacy of mining in Gunnerside Beck	103
<b>4.7. Conclusion</b>	<b>103</b>

**CHAPTER 5****METAL DISTRIBUTION IN FLOODPLAIN SEDIMENT**

<b>5.1. Introduction</b>	<b>105</b>
<b>5.2. Methods</b>	<b>106</b>

<b>5.3. Metal distribution patterns</b>	<b>109</b>
5.3.1. Introduction	109
5.3.2. Downstream metal distribution patterns	110
5.3.3. Lateral metal distribution patterns	110
5.3.3.1. <i>Hartlakes</i>	110
5.3.3.2. <i>Reeth</i>	113
5.3.3.3. <i>Hudswell</i>	113
5.3.3.4. <i>Brompton-on-Swale</i>	116
5.3.3.5. <i>Great Langton</i>	116
5.3.3.6. <i>Morton Flatts</i>	118
5.3.3.7. <i>Fairholme</i>	120
5.3.3.8. <i>Maunby</i>	121
5.3.3.9. <i>Holme</i>	122
5.3.3.10. <i>Eldmire</i>	123
5.3.3.11. <i>Thornton Manor</i>	124
5.3.3.12. <i>Myton-on-Swale</i>	124
5.3.3.13. <i>Additional floodplain cores</i>	124
5.3.4. Summary: Metal distribution patterns in floodplain sediments	127
<b>5.4. Controls on metal distribution</b>	<b>127</b>
5.4.1. Introduction	127
5.4.2. Longitudinal distribution patterns	128
5.4.3. Lateral distribution patterns	131
5.4.4. Metal distribution patterns with depth	140
5.4.5. Summary: Controls on metal distribution in floodplain sediments	140
<b>5.5. Conclusion</b>	<b>141</b>

## CHAPTER 6

### PATTERNS OF METAL DISTRIBUTION IN CONTEMPORARY FLOOD SEDIMENTS

<b>6.1. Introduction</b>	<b>142</b>
<b>6.2. Methods</b>	<b>143</b>
6.2.1. Recent floods in the Swale catchment	143
6.2.2. Flood sediment: sampling and analysis	144
6.2.3. Measuring overbank metal deposition	148

<b>6.3. Metal distribution patterns in flood sediments</b>	<b>149</b>
6.3.1. Introduction	149
6.3.2. October-December 2000 floods	150
6.3.2.1. <i>Channel-edge sediment</i>	150
6.3.2.2. <i>Overbank sediment</i>	150
6.3.3. November-December 2001 floods	153
6.3.3.1. <i>Channel-edge sediment</i>	153
6.3.3.2. <i>Overbank sediment</i>	153
6.3.4. January-February 2002 floods	155
6.3.4.1. <i>Channel-edge sediment</i>	155
6.3.4.2. <i>Overbank sediment</i>	157
6.3.5. Grain size partitioning in flood sediments	157
6.3.6 Metal deposition on the River Swale floodplain	161
6.3.7. Summary: Metal distribution patterns in flood sediments	164
<b>6.4. Controls of downstream metal concentrations in flood sediments</b>	<b>168</b>
6.4.1. Introduction	168
6.4.2. Downstream decline of metals on flood sediments	168
6.4.3. Sediment inputs	168
6.4.4. Geomorphological controls	172
6.4.5. The influence of flood magnitude on metal concentrations	175
6.4.6. Summary: Controls of downstream metal distribution in flood sediments	178
<b>6.5. Conclusion</b>	<b>178</b>
 <b>CHAPTER 7</b>	
<b>METAL STORAGE IN THE RIVER SWALE CATCHMENT</b>	
<b>7.1. Introduction</b>	<b>180</b>
<b>7.2. Metal storage in formerly mined tributaries</b>	<b>181</b>
7.2.1. Introduction	181
7.2.2. Methods: Estimating metal storage in Gunnerside Beck	181
7.2.3. Metal storage in Gunnerside Beck	183
7.2.4. Potential metal storage in tributary sediments	188
7.2.5. Summary: Metal storage in tributary sediments	188
<b>7.3. Metal storage in floodplain sediments</b>	<b>191</b>
7.3.1. Introduction	191



7.3.2. Methods: Estimating floodplain metal storage	191
7.3.3. Metal storage in the River Swale floodplain	192
7.3.4. Summary: Metal storage in floodplain sediments	198
<b>7.4. Metal storage and fluxes in the River Swale catchment</b>	<b>199</b>
<b>7.5. Conclusion</b>	<b>201</b>

## CHAPTER 8

### ASSESSING THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT OF MINING IN THE SWALE CATCHMENT

<b>8.1. Introduction</b>	<b>202</b>
<b>8.2. Assessment using environmental quality guidelines</b>	<b>203</b>
8.2.1. Environmental quality guidelines in the U.K	203
8.2.2. Comparison with U.K guidelines	206
8.2.3. Limitations of existing guidelines	212
<b>8.3. Assessing using background concentrations</b>	<b>213</b>
8.3.1. Approaches to background determination	213
8.3.2. Determining background metal concentrations in the Swale catchment	215
8.3.3. Comparison with background concentrations	221
8.3.4. Limitations of estimating background concentrations	225
<b>8.4. Environmental impacts of metal enrichment</b>	<b>227</b>
8.4.1. Implications of metal enrichment in fluvial sediments	227
8.4.2. Potential management strategies	229
<b>8.5. Conclusion: The environmental impact of metal mining</b>	<b>231</b>

## CHAPTER 9

### CONCLUSIONS

<b>9.1. Summary of findings</b>	<b>233</b>
9.1.1. Metals in tributary sediments	233
9.1.2. Metals in floodplain sediments	234
9.1.3. Metals in flood sediments	234
9.1.4. Metal storage in the Swale catchment	235
9.1.5. The environmental impact of mining	235
<b>9.2. Overall conclusions</b>	<b>236</b>

<b>9.3. Implications</b>	<b>236</b>
<b>9.4. Recommendations for further research</b>	<b>238</b>
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b>	<b>240</b>
<b>APPENDIX 1: GUNNERSIDE BECK DATA</b>	<b>257</b>
<b>APPENDIX 2: FLOODPLAIN SEDIMENT DATA</b>	<b>261</b>
<b>APPENDIX 3: FLOOD SEDIMENT DATA</b>	<b>267</b>

---

## LIST OF FIGURES

---

### CHAPTER 2

Figure 2.1:	The River Swale catchment, showing drainage network and major tributaries	19
Figure 2.2:	Geology of the Swale catchment	21
Figure 2.3:	The distribution of mineral veins in the Swale catchment	22
Figure 2.4:	Geomorphological characteristics of the River Swale	26
Figure 2.5:	Location and output of Pb mines in Swaledale	32
Figure 2.6:	The ore dressing process employed in Swaledale Pb mines	35
Figure 2.7:	Location of smelters and dressing floors in Swaledale	38
Figure 2.8:	Total Pb production by tributary	41
Figure 2.9:	Metal contamination in River Swale channel sediments	47

### CHAPTER 3

Figure 3.1:	Flow chart detailing the HNO <sub>3</sub> digestion procedure used in this investigation	53
-------------	--	----

### CHAPTER 4

Figure 4.1:	Map of the Gunnerside Beck catchment, showing drainage network, relief, and location of mines, dressing floors and smelters	61
Figure 4.2:	Major mineral veins in the Gunnerside catchment	62
Figure 4.3:	Geomorphological characteristics of Gunnerside Beck	64
Figure 4.4:	The Blakethwaite lead mines	69
Figure 4.5:	The Lownathwaite and Old Gang mines	71
Figure 4.6:	Sediment sample sites in Gunnerside Beck	77
Figure 4.7:	Pb, Zn and Cd concentrations in 2000-63 $\mu$ m Gunnerside Beck mine spoil	81
Figure 4.8:	Pb, Zn and Cd concentrations in <63 $\mu$ m Gunnerside Beck mine spoil	82

Figure 4.9:	Pb, Zn and Cd concentrations in 2000-63 $\mu\text{m}$ Gunnerside Beck floodplain sediments	83
Figure 4.10:	Pb, Zn and Cd concentrations in <63 $\mu\text{m}$ Gunnerside Beck floodplain sediments	84
Figure 4.11:	Floodplain contamination schematic	88
Figure 4.12:	Pb, Zn and Cd concentrations in 2000-63 $\mu\text{m}$ Gunnerside Beck channel sediments	89
Figure 4.13:	Pb, Zn and Cd concentrations in <63 $\mu\text{m}$ Gunnerside Beck channel sediments	90
Figure 4.14:	Grain size characteristics of Gunnerside Beck floodplain sediments, channel sediments and mine spoil	94
Figure 4.15:	Gunnerside Beck 2000-63 $\mu\text{m}$ concentrations, waste inputs and catchment characteristics	96
Figure 4.16:	Gunnerside Beck <63 $\mu\text{m}$ concentrations, waste inputs and catchment characteristics	97

## CHAPTER 5

Figure 5.1:	Floodplain sediment study sites in the River Swale catchment	108
Figure 5.2:	Downstream trends in metal dispersal	111
Figure 5.3:	Floodplain metal concentrations and surface topography at Hartlakes	112
Figure 5.4:	Floodplain metal concentrations and surface topography at Reeth	114
Figure 5.5:	Floodplain metal concentrations and surface topography at Hudswell	115
Figure 5.6:	Floodplain metal concentrations and surface topography at Brompton-on-Swale	117
Figure 5.7:	Floodplain metal concentrations and surface topography at Great Langton	118
Figure 5.8:	Floodplain metal concentrations and surface topography at Morton Flatts	119
Figure 5.9:	Floodplain metal concentrations and surface topography at Fairholme	120
Figure 5.10:	Floodplain metal concentrations and surface topography at Maunby	121
Figure 5.11:	Floodplain metal concentrations and surface topography at Holme	122
Figure 5.12:	Floodplain metal concentrations and surface topography at Eldmire	123
Figure 5.13:	Floodplain metal concentrations and surface topography at Thornton Manor	125

Figure 5.14:	Floodplain metal concentrations and surface topography at Myton-on-Swale	126
Figure 5.15:	Pb concentration in floodplain and tributary sediments, and geomorphological characteristics	129
Figure 5.16:	Floodplain metal concentrations and elevation	134
Figure 5.17:	Simulated inundation frequency and floodplain metal concentrations at Reeth	137
Figure 5.18:	Simulated inundation frequency and floodplain metal concentrations at Brompton-on-Swale	138

## CHAPTER 6

Figure 6.1:	Mean, minimum and maximum daily discharge at Catterick Bridge gauging station	145
Figure 6.2:	Map of the River Swale catchment, showing flood sediment sampling sites and the location of major tributaries	146
Figure 6.3:	Pb, Zn and Cd concentrations in 2000 channel-edge flood sediment	151
Figure 6.4:	Pb, Zn and Cd concentrations in 2000 overbank flood sediment	152
Figure 6.5:	Pb, Zn and Cd concentrations in 2001 channel-edge flood sediment	154
Figure 6.6:	Pb, Zn and Cd concentrations in 2001 overbank flood sediment	155
Figure 6.7:	Pb, Zn and Cd concentrations in 2002 channel-edge flood sediment	156
Figure 6.8:	Pb, Zn and Cd concentrations in 2002 overbank flood sediment	158
Figure 6.9:	Grain size characteristics of channel-edge flood sediments	159
Figure 6.10:	Grain size characteristics of overbank flood sediments	160
Figure 6.11:	Overbank sediment and metal deposition along the River Swale	162
Figure 6.12:	Pb concentrations in 2000, 2001 and 2002 flood sediments	165
Figure 6.13:	Zn concentrations in 2000, 2001 and 2002 flood sediments	166
Figure 6.14:	Cd concentrations in 2000, 2001 and 2002 flood sediments	167
Figure 6.15:	Pb concentrations in channel-edge flood sediment, tributaries and floodplain sediment, and geomorphological characteristics	170
Figure 6.16:	Pb concentrations in overbank flood sediment, tributaries and floodplain sediment, and geomorphological characteristics	171

**CHAPTER 7**

Figure 7.1:	Estimating metal storage in tributary and floodplain sediments	182
Figure 7.2:	Floodplain Pb storage in Gunnerside Beck	184
Figure 7.3:	Likely maximum extent of floodplain metal storage in the Swale catchment	194

**CHAPTER 8**

Figure 8.1:	Swale tributary, floodplain and flood sediments and U.K. environmental quality guidelines for Pb	208
Figure 8.2:	Swale tributary, floodplain and flood sediments and U.K. environmental quality guidelines for Pb	209
Figure 8.3:	Swale tributary, floodplain and flood sediments and U.K. environmental quality guidelines for Pb	210
Figure 8.4:	Cumulative frequency curves for Pb, Zn and Cd	218
Figure 8.5:	Recalculated background population ( $F'$ ) for Pb, Zn and Cd	220
Figure 8.6:	Swale tributary, floodplain and flood sediments and background concentrations for Pb	222
Figure 8.7:	Swale tributary, floodplain and flood sediments and background concentrations for Pb	223
Figure 8.8:	Swale tributary, floodplain and flood sediments and background concentrations for Pb	224

---

## LIST OF TABLES

---

### CHAPTER 2

Table 2.1:	Flood frequency and magnitude in the Yorkshire Ouse basin, reconstructed from instrumental records	28
Table 2.2:	Flood frequency and magnitude in the Yorkshire Ouse basin, reconstructed from flood deposits	28
Table 2.3:	Recorded and estimated lead production	40
Table 2.4:	Recorded production of lead metal and concentrates in the North Swaledale Mineral Belt	40
Table 2.5:	Recorded production of lead metal and concentrates in the South Swaledale mining zone	40

### CHAPTER 3

Table 3.1:	Sampling and analytical coefficient of variation data for tributary, floodplain and flood sediments	57
------------	---	----

### CHAPTER 4

Table 4.1:	Multiple regression results: The relationship between metal concentrations and geomorphological parameters in Gunnerside Beck floodplain sediments	86
Table 4.2:	Multiple regression results: The relationship between metal concentrations and geomorphological parameters in Gunnerside Beck channel sediments	92

### CHAPTER 5

Table 5.1:	Study reach characteristics	107
Table 5.2:	Multiple regression results: The relationship between floodplain metal concentrations and geomorphological parameters	130

**CHAPTER 6**

Table 6.1:	Multiple regression results: The relationship between metal concentrations in channel-edge flood sediments and geomorphological parameters	173
Table 6.2:	Multiple regression results: The relationship between metal concentrations in overbank flood sediments and geomorphological parameters	174

**CHAPTER 7**

Table 7.1:	Estimated storage of Pb in formerly mined tributaries	189
Table 7.2:	Estimated storage of Pb in floodplain sediments	193

**CHAPTER 8**

Table 8.1:	U.K. metal concentration guidelines for Pb, Zn and Cd	205
Table 8.2:	Percentage failure of environmental quality guidelines	207
Table 8.3:	Descriptive statistics for fluvial sediments from the Swale catchment	216
Table 8.4:	Background concentrations for Pb, Zn and Cd in the Swale catchment	221
Table 8.5:	Percentage of samples exceeding background metal concentrations	225



---

## LIST OF PLATES

---

### CHAPTER 2

Plate 2.1:	North Hush and Priscilla Level, Gunnerside Beck	34
Plate 2.2:	Bouse teams, Old Gang Company dressing floor, Sir Francis Level, Gunnerside Beck	34
Plate 2.3:	Water-powered crusher, Bunton Level, Gunnerside Beck	36
Plate 2.4:	Surrender smelt mill, Barney Beck	39

### CHAPTER 4

Plate 4.1:	The upper reaches of Gunnerside Beck	65
Plate 4.2:	Floodplain deposits downstream of the Old Gang and Lownathwaite mines	65
Plate 4.3:	Floodplain deposits and the AD Company dressing floor at Sir Francis Level	66
Plate 4.4:	Blakethwaite smelter and the Blind Gill – Gunnerside Beck confluence	70
Plate 4.5:	Sun Hush and North Hush	72
Plate 4.6:	Bouse teams and the remains of a crushing mill at Bunton Level dressing floor	74
Plate 4.7:	Channel braiding upstream of the Old Gang and Lownathwaite hushes	100
Plate 4.8:	Braid bars and chutes downstream of the Old Gang and Lownathwaite hushes	100
Plate 4.9:	Eroding bank section showing mining-related floodplain development	101

### CHAPTER 6

Plate 6.1:	Overbank sediments deposited in January-February 2002	147
------------	---	-----